



**THE STATES assembled on Tuesday  
14th September 2021, at 9.30 a.m. under  
the Presidency of the Bailiff,  
Timothy John Le Cocq, Esquire.**

---

**His Excellency the Lieutenant Governor,  
Air Chief Marshall Sir Stephen Dalton, G.C.B., LL.D. (Hon.), D.Sc. (Hon.), B.Sc., F.R.Ae.S.,  
C.C.M.I. was present.**

---

All members were present at roll call with the exception of –

Senator Ian Joseph Gorst – absent on States business  
Connétable Sadie Anthea Le Sueur-Rennard of St. Saviour – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 9.42 a.m.)  
Connétable John Edward Le Maistre of Grouville – excused attendance (arrived in the Chamber at 10.39 a.m.)  
Connétable Richard Vibert of St. Peter – excused attendance  
Deputy Geoffrey Peter Southern of St. Helier – en défaut (défaut raised at 9.38 a.m.)  
Deputy Charles Hugh Raymond of Trinity – excused attendance (joined at 11.32 a.m.)  
Deputy Jessica Harriet Perchard of St. Saviour – parental responsibilities

---

Prayers

---

**Connétable of St. Clement – welcome**

The Bailiff, on behalf of all Members, welcomed newly-elected Connétable Marcus O'Donnel Troy of St. Clement to the Assembly.

**Arrangement of public business for the present meeting**

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade, agreed, in accordance with Standing Order 80, to suspend Standing Order 32 in order that his proposition entitled 'States Meetings: Continuation of Remote Participation' (P.87/2021) might be listed for consideration at the present meeting; and agreed to reduce, in accordance with Standing Order 26(7), the minimum lodging period in respect of the same proposition in order that it might be debated at the present meeting; and further agreed to consider the proposition as the next item of business at the meeting.

Members present voted as follows –

**POUR: 40**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
Senator S.C. Ferguson  
Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
Senator T.A. Vallois  
Senator S.W. Pallett  
Senator S.Y. Mézec  
Connétable of St. Helier  
Connétable of St. Lawrence

**CONTRE: 5**

Senator K.L. Moore  
Connétable of St. Clement  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

**ABSTAIN: 0**

Connétable of St. Saviour  
 Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Grouville  
 Connétable of St. John  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Connétable of St. Mary  
 Connétable of St. Ouen  
 Connétable of St. Martin  
 Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
 Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
 Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
 Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
 Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
 Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
 Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
 Deputy of St. Martin  
 Deputy of St. Ouen  
 Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
 Deputy R. Labey (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
 Deputy of St. Mary  
 Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
 Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
 Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
 Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
 Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
 Deputy of St. Peter  
 Deputy of St. John  
 Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
 Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
 Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)  
 Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

### States Meetings: Continuation of Remote Participation P.87/2021

THE STATES, adopting a proposition of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade entitled ‘States Meetings: Continuation of Remote Participation’ (P.87/2021), agreed that, notwithstanding Standing Order 55A(1), Members who did not wish to attend in the States Chamber might continue to take part in States meetings using Microsoft Teams until the States had considered and voted upon a proposition to re-apply Standing Order 55A(1) or to repeal or vary the terms of the Standing Order.

Members present voted as follows –

#### **POUR: 40**

Senator L.J. Farnham  
 Senator S.C. Ferguson  
 Senator J.A.N. Le Fondré  
 Senator T.A. Vallois  
 Senator K.L. Moore  
 Senator S.W. Pallett  
 Senator S.Y. Mézec  
 Connétable of St. Helier  
 Connétable of St. Clement  
 Connétable of St. Lawrence

#### **CONTRE: 4**

Connétable of St. Brelade  
 Connétable of Trinity  
 Deputy M.R. Le Hegarat (H)  
 Deputy S.M. Ahier (H)

#### **ABSTAIN: 1**

Deputy I. Gardiner (H)

Connétable of St. Saviour  
Connétable of Grouville  
Connétable of St. John  
Connétable of St. Mary  
Connétable of St. Ouen  
Connétable of St. Martin  
Deputy J.A. Martin (H)  
Deputy G.P. Southern (H)  
Deputy of Grouville  
Deputy K.C. Lewis (S)  
Deputy M. Tadier (B)  
Deputy M.R. Higgins (H)  
Deputy J.M. Maçon (S)  
Deputy S.J. Pinel (C)  
Deputy of St. Martin  
Deputy of St. Ouen  
Deputy L.M.C. Doublet (S)  
Deputy R. Labey (H)  
Deputy S.M. Wickenden (H)  
Deputy of St. Mary  
Deputy G.J. Truscott (B)  
Deputy J.H. Young (B)  
Deputy L.B.E. Ash (C)  
Deputy K.F. Morel (L)  
Deputy G.C.U. Guida (L)  
Deputy of St. Peter  
Deputy of St. John  
Deputy R.J. Ward (H)  
Deputy C.S. Alves (H)  
Deputy K.G. Pamplin (S)

### **Suspension of meeting**

The Bailiff, following the adoption of the proposition of Deputy John Hilary Young of St. Brelade entitled ‘States Meetings: Continuation of Remote Participation’ (P.87/2021), suspended the meeting for a period of 45 minutes, in accordance with Standing Order 46, to allow time for those members who did not wish to attend the meeting in the States Chamber to make arrangements to continue to take part remotely using Microsoft Teams. Upon resumption of the meeting, the States assembled in accordance with Standing Order 55A with members able to participate remotely using Microsoft Teams.

### **Anniversary of the Corn Riots**

The Bailiff drew members’ attention to the public holiday that would take place on 27th September 2021, to commemorate the anniversary of the Corn Riots of 1769.

### **Democracy Week**

The Bailiff informed the Assembly that 27th September 2021 would mark the start of Democracy Week, during which a number of events arranged by the States Greffe would take place to encourage greater public engagement with the work of the Assembly.

**Jersey Youth Parliament**

The Bailiff informed members that a meeting of the Jersey Youth Parliament would take place in the States Chamber on 28th September 2021.

**Subordinate enactments tabled**

The following enactments were tabled, namely –

Covid-19 (Workplace Restrictions) (Amendment No. 13) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	R&O.88/2021.
Access to Justice (Legal Aid Guidelines) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Home Affairs.</i>	R&O.96/2021.
Covid-19 (Workplace – Twenty-Fifth Extension) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	R&O.97/2021.
Covid-19 (Gathering Control – Ninth Extension) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	R&O.98/2021.
Sea Fisheries (Spider Crabs – Restrictions on Fishing) (Amendment No. 2) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for the Environment.</i>	R&O.99/2021.
Control of Housing and Work (Temporary Exemption) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Chief Minister.</i>	R&O.100/2021.
Covid-19 (Workplace Restrictions and Gathering Control) (Amendment No. 8) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	R&O.101/2021.
Education (Grants and Allowances) (Academic Year 2021-2022) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Children and Education.</i>	R&O.102/2021.
Road Traffic (St. Lawrence) (Amendment No. 26) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Infrastructure.</i>	R&O.103/2021.
Sanctions and Asset-Freezing (Implementation of External Sanctions) (Amendment – Belarus) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for External Relations and Financial Services.</i>	R&O.104/2021.
Animal Health (Miscellaneous Amendments – Diseases) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Infrastructure.</i>	R&O.105/2021.
Covid-19 (Gathering Control Repeal and Workplace Restrictions Amendment) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	R&O.106/2021.
Covid-19 (Workplace - Twenty-Sixth Extension) (Jersey) Order 2021. <i>Minister for Health and Social Services.</i>	R&O.107/2021.

Emergency Powers and Planning (Medicines and Vaccines - Covid-19 and Influenza) (Fourth Period) (Jersey) Order 2021. R&O.108/2021.  
*Minister for Health and Social Services.*

### Documents presented

Vote of Censure: Council of Ministers – comments. Presented: 10th September 2021, <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.72/2021. Com.
Chief Executive Officer – Recruitment Process: comments. Presented: 9th September 2021, <i>Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.</i>	P.73/2021. Com.
Chief Executive Officer – Recruitment Process: comments. Presented: 10th September 2021, <i>States Employment Board.</i>	P.73/2021. Com.(2).
Chief Executive Officer – Recruitment Process: comments. Presented: 10th September 2021, <i>Council of Ministers.</i>	P.73/2021. Com.(3).
Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 1 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202-: comments. Presented: 10th September 2021, <i>Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel.</i>	P.78/2021. Com.
Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 1 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202-: Addendum Presented: 7th September 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources.</i>	P.78/2021. Add.
Social Security (Amendment of Law - Minimum Earnings Threshold) (Jersey) Regulations 202-: comments. Presented: 10th September 2021, <i>Health and Social Security Scrutiny Panel.</i>	P.79/2021. Com.
Overall Management of Public Finances during the Covid-19 Pandemic (R.114/2021): Executive Response. Presented: 3rd August 2021, <i>Public Accounts Committee.</i>	R.114/2021. Res.
States of Jersey Law 2005: Delegation of Functions – Minister for Home Affairs – Appointment of Assistant Minister. Presented: 23rd July 2021, <i>Minister for Home Affairs.</i>	R.126/2021.
Jersey Consumer Council Annual Report 2020. Presented: 23rd July 2021, <i>Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.</i>	R.127/2021.
States of Jersey Law 2005: Delegation of Functions – Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture – Shipping Delegations. Presented: 23rd July 2021, <i>Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.</i>	R.128/2021.
Jersey Gambling Commission Annual Report and Accounts 2020. Presented: 26th July 2021, <i>Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture.</i>	R.129/2021.
States Employment Board Annual Report 2020. Presented: 3rd August 2021, <i>States Employment Board.</i>	R.130/2021.

States Investment Strategies. Presented: 9th August 2021, Minister for Treasury and Resources.	R.131/2021.
Debt Framework. Presented: 10th August 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	R.132/2021.
Finance Law Delegation Report for the six-month period to 30th June 2021. Presented: 20th August 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	R.133/2021.
States of Jersey Law 2005: Delegation of functions – Minister for Treasury and Resources – Revised Delegations August 2021. Presented: 20th August 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	R.134/2021.
Presentation to the States Assembly of the 2020 Annual Reports and Accounts of the wholly and majority owned States-owned entities: Report. Presented: 20th August 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	R.135/2021.
Fiscal Stimulus Fund – Update Report – August 2021. Presented: 27th August 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	R.136/2021.
States of Jersey Complaints Board: Findings – Complaint by Mr. R. Ahmad against the Deputy Chief Minister regarding an application for Residential and Employment Status. Presented: 31st August 2021, <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee</i> .	R.137/2021.
Mid-year Review: Government Plan 2021-2024 Presented: 31st August 2021, <i>Chief Minister</i> .	R.138/2021. (re-issue)
Housing Policy Guidance: Housing affordability and the South Hill development Presented: 1st September 2021, <i>Council of Ministers</i> .	R.139/2021.
Commissioner for Standards Annual Report 2020-21 Presented: 6th September 2021, <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee</i> .	R.140/2021.
Land Transactions Under Standing Order 168(3) – Office Suite, 16 Britannia Place, Bath Street, St Helier JE2 4YS – Lease Presented: 7th September 2021, <i>Minister for Infrastructure</i> .	R.141/2021.
Transfers Between Heads of Expenditure Under the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2019: Article 18 – 3rd September 2021. Presented: 7th September 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	R.142/2021.
Governance Arrangements for Health and Social Care – Follow up. Presented: 13th September 2021, <i>Comptroller and Auditor General</i> .	R.143/2021.
Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – Grainville Sports Pavilion and Land, St. Saviour’s Hill, St Saviour – Lease Presented: 13th September 2021, <i>Minister for Infrastructure</i> .	R.144/2021.
Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – Unit 73 and 74, Central Market, St. Helier – Lease. Presented: 13th September 2021, <i>Minister for Infrastructure</i> .	R.145/2021.
Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – The Willows Day Care Centre and Willow House, Green Street, St Helier – Disposal. Presented: 14th September 2021, <i>Minister for Infrastructure</i> .	R.146/2021.

Land Transactions under Standing Order 168(3) – Land adjoining Le Braye Public Toilets, La Grande Route des Mielles, St. Brelade. Presented: 13th September 2021, <i>Minister for Infrastructure</i> .	R.147/2021.
Transfers between Heads of Expenditure under the Public Finances (Jersey) Law 2019: Article 18 – 10th September 2021. Presented: 14th September 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	R.148/2021.
Demerger of CICRA and Future Operation of the JCRA. Presented: 13th August 2021, <i>Economic and International Affairs Panel</i> .	S.R.11/2021.
People and Culture Review Presented: 3rd September 2021, <i>Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel</i> .	S.R.12/2021.
Review of States Annual Report & Accounts 2020. Presented: 16th August 2021, <i>Public Accounts Committee</i> .	P.A.C.1/2021.

### Notification of lodged propositions

Draft Taxation (Income Tax, Goods and Services Tax and Revenue Administration) (Amendment) (Jersey) Law 202- (P.51/2021): third amendment. Lodged: 23rd August 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	P.51/2021. Amd.(3).
Chief Executive Officer – Recruitment Process. Lodged: 30th July 2021, <i>Deputy K.F. Morel of St. Lawrence</i> .	P.73/2021.
States Meetings: Move to a three-week cycle. Lodged: 30th July 2021, <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee</i> .	P.74/2021. (re-issue)
Draft Finance (2020 Budget) (Jersey) Law 2020 (Appointed Day) Act 202-. Lodged: 30th July 2021, <i>Chief Minister</i> .	P.75/2021.
Draft Planning and Building (Amendment No. 8) (Jersey) Law 202-. Lodged: 2nd August 2021, <i>Minister for the Environment</i> .	P.76/2021.
Draft States of Jersey (Amendment No. 10) Law 202-. Lodged: 3rd August 2021, <i>Chief Minister</i> .	P.77/2021.
Draft Income Tax (Amendment – Stage 1 of Independent Taxation) (Jersey) Law 202-. Lodged: 3rd August 2021, <i>Minister for Treasury and Resources</i> .	P.78/2021.
Social Security (Amendment of Law - Minimum Earnings Threshold) (Jersey) Regulations 202-. Lodged: 3rd August 2021, <i>Minister for Social Security</i> .	P.79/2021.
Our Hospital – Budget, Financing and Land Assembly. Lodged: 3rd August 2021, <i>Council of Ministers</i> .	P.80/2021. (re-issue)
Our Hospital – Budget, Financing and Land Assembly (P.80/2021): amendment. Lodged: 13th August 2021, <i>Connétable of St. Helier</i> .	P.80/2021. Amd.
Draft Electronic Communications (Amendment No. 2) (Jersey) Law 202-. Lodged: 10th August 2021, <i>Minister for Economic Development, Tourism, Sport and Culture</i> .	P.81/2021.

Draft Legislation (Commencement of Law) (Jersey) Act 202-. Lodged: 11th August 2021, <i>Privileges and Procedures Committee</i> .	P.82/2021.
Draft Covid-19 (Enabling Provisions) (Amendment No. 3) (Jersey) Law 202-. Lodged: 23rd August 2021, <i>Minister for Health and Social Services</i> .	P.83/2021.
Draft Covid-19 (Amendments – Further Extensions) (Jersey) Regulations 202-. Lodged: 23rd August 2021, <i>Minister for Health and Social Services</i> .	P.84/2021.
Draft Covid-19 (Employment-Minimum Wage) (Jersey) Regulations 202-. Lodged: 2nd September 2021, <i>Minister for Social Security</i> .	P.85/2021.
Competent Authorities Ministers: Release of minutes of meetings to Scrutiny Lodged: 6th September 2021, <i>Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel</i> .	P.86/2021.
States Meetings: Continuation of Remote Participation. Lodged: 14th September 2021, <i>Deputy J.H. Young of St. Brelade</i> .	P.87/2021.

### **Public Accounts Committee: appointment of elected member**

In accordance with the provisions of Standing Order 123(1), the Chair of the Public Accounts Committee nominated the Connétable of St. John as an elected member of the Public Accounts Committee.

There being no other nominations, the Bailiff declared that the Connétable of St. John had been duly appointed as an elected member of the Public Accounts Committee.

### **Planning Committee – appointment of member**

In accordance with Standing Order 125A, the Chair of the Planning Committee indicated that he wished to have a Committee of 9 members, including the Chair, and nominated Deputy Jeremy Martin Maçon of St. Saviour as a member of the Committee.

There being no other nominations, the Bailiff declared that Deputy Jeremy Martin Maçon of St. Saviour had been duly appointed as a member of the Planning Committee.

### **Written Questions**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

- WQ.352/2021 1. The Minister for Health and Social Services had tabled an answer on 26th July 2021 to a question asked by Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier regarding the impact of Covid-19 on children.
- WQ.353/2021 2. The Minister for Treasury and Resources had tabled an answer on 26th July 2021 to a question asked by Senator S.Y. Mézec regarding dividends received from the States of Jersey Development Company.
- WQ.354/2021 3. The Minister for Infrastructure had tabled an answer on 26th July 2021 to a question asked by the Connétable of St. John regarding the connection of properties to mains drains.
- WQ.355/2021 4. The Minister for Children and Education had tabled an answer on 26th July 2021 to a question asked by Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour regarding the minutes of the Corporate Parenting Board.



**Oral Questions***(see Official Report/Hansard)*

- OQ.187/2021 1. Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the travel to Jersey of residents with settled status.
- OQ.185/2021 2. The Connétable of St. Martin asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the development of funding models and strategies for the preservation and restoration of historical buildings in the Island.
- OQ.190/2021 3. Deputy L.M.C. Doublet of St. Saviour asked a question of the Minister for Social Security regarding the treatment in the workplace of women experiencing menopause symptoms.
- OQ.189/2021 4. The Deputy of St. Mary asked a question of the Minister for Infrastructure regarding the impact of funding transfers from the Foul Sewer Extensions project.
- OQ.192/2021 5. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding the publication of data concerning relative low income.
- OQ.194/2021 6. Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Social Security regarding Short Term Incapacity Allowance.
- OQ.181/2021 7. Senator K.L. Moore asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the Jersey Police Complaints Authority.
- OQ.183/2021 8. Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier asked a question of the Assistant Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the sale by JT of Internet of Things Limited.
- OQ.196/2021 9. Senator S.Y. Mézec asked a question of the Minister for Housing and Communities regarding the calculation of social housing rents.
- OQ.191/2021 10. Deputy S.M. Ahier of St. Helier asked a question of the Chair of the States Employment Board regarding the 2022 pay offer.
- OQ.186/2021 11. The Connétable of St. Martin asked a question of the Minister for Treasury and Resources regarding the implementation of independent taxation.
- OQ.195/2021 12. Deputy M. Tadier of St. Brelade asked a question of the Minister for Social Security regarding the introduction of maximum work time regulations.
- OQ.193/2021 13. Deputy G.P. Southern of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Health and Social Services regarding waiting times for routine operations.
- OQ.184/2021 14. Deputy I. Gardiner of St. Helier asked a question of the Chief Minister regarding his public acknowledgements of seeking legal advice from the Law Officers' Department.
- OQ.182/2021 15. Senator K.L. Moore asked a question of the Minister for Home Affairs regarding the Norfolk Police investigation into the Planning Department.
- OQ.188/2021 16. Deputy R.J. Ward of St. Helier asked a question of the Minister for Infrastructure regarding the use of biodiesel fuel by the States of Jersey's transport fleet and bus service.
- OQ.197/2021 17. Senator S.Y. Mézec asked a question of the Minister for Social Security regarding the opportunity for face-to-face walk-in appointments at Philip Le Feuvre House.

**Changes in Presidency**

The Bailiff retired from the Chamber during the period of Oral Questions with notice and the meeting continued under the Presidency of Dr. Mark Egan, Greffier of the States. The meeting resumed following the lunch adjournment, during the period of Oral Questions with notice, under the Presidency of the Bailiff.

**Oral Questions without notice**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

The Minister for Children and Education answered questions without notice from members.

The Minister for Social Security answered questions without notice from members.

The Chief Minister answered questions without notice from members.

**Personal statement**

*(see Official Report/Hansard)*

Deputy Jeremy Martin Maçon of St. Saviour, in accordance with Standing Order 16(3), made a personal statement regarding the recent police investigation to which he had been subject.

**Vote of Censure: Council of Ministers P.72/2021**

THE STATES commenced consideration of a proposition of Senator Samuel Yves Mézec entitled 'Vote of Censure: Council of Ministers' (P.72/2021).

**Adjournment**

THE STATES adjourned, having agreed to reconvene on Wednesday 15th September 2021, to continue consideration of the proposition of Senator Samuel Yves Mézec entitled 'Vote of Censure: Council of Ministers' (P.72/2021) and the other outstanding items of public business listed for the meeting.

THE STATES rose at 5.29 p.m.

**DR. M. EGAN**

*Greffier of the States*